Praise for Moderating Usability Tests

Interacting with participants in a calm and neutral manner may well be the most difficult part of doing usability testing. Now you no longer have to worry about how to do that. Just follow Dumas and Loring’s wonderful, practical advice and you will be prepared not only for typical encounters, but also for the unusual and unexpected, for doing remote testing, and for working with special populations. *Moderating Usability Tests* is a great resource for anyone who interacts with usability test participants.

—Janice (Ginny) Redish, President, Redish & Associates, Inc.

Everyone talks about research methods, but the formal aspects of those methods only get you so far. The difference between getting a little data or a lot of data, only discovering problems or getting ideas about solutions, bias or validity, throw-away data versus generalizable insights, often depends on the soft skills—the ability to effectively moderate testing. In the past, you were expected to get these skills through apprenticeships or trial and error. *Moderating Usability Tests* removes the mystery and provides practical advice on how to get the most out of research. It will be invaluable to students learning about usability testing for the first time, people newly charged with evaluating products, and even old hands looking to refine and improve their technique.

—Arnold (Arnie) Lund, Director of User Experience, Microsoft

You may not think that being a “Gracious Host” is among your assignments in moderating a usability test, but you will learn why this and other roles with similarly illuminating names are important to your success. In this generous book, Dumas and Loring give the benefit of their decades of experience and astute observation of both the foundational and the subtle aspects of conducting usability tests. Many questions you didn’t think to ask until you were on the hot seat are answered here, and will help you achieve a level of confidence as a test moderator that may have seemed beyond reach, even if your participants are from challenging-to-test populations. With this highly ethical and thoroughly grounded program for developing moderator skills and avoiding pitfalls, Dumas and Loring make a strong contribution to the body of knowledge on testing products. The big surprise of the book is that their clear, reasoned, and detailed suggestions about interacting with test participants and developers will likely spill over and improve your relationships with coworkers, family, neighbors, and friends.

—Elisabeth Bayle, Bayle Collaborations

At this point, virtually everyone in the software industry knows what usability testing is. An unfortunate side effect of this awareness is that many people are conducting usability testing who have no idea how to do so in a way that will yield valid, reliable, and useful data. Other than the design of the test itself, proper and effective moderation of test sessions is one of the most important—and least understood—aspects of usability testing. Here is a book by two highly regarded experts that covers this topic thoroughly in a very readable format. No one who has not already been well trained should attempt to conduct usability testing without first reading this book cover to cover, and viewing all the excellent videos the authors provide on the book’s web site.

—Deborah J. Mayhew, Deborah J. Mayhew & Associates
Moderating Usability Tests
The Morgan Kaufmann Series in Interactive Technologies

Series Editors: Stuart Card, PARC; Jonathan Grudin, Microsoft; and Jakob Nielsen, Nielsen Norman Group

Measuring the User Experience: Collecting, Analyzing, and Presenting Usability Metrics
Thomas Tullis and William Albert

Keeping Found Things Found: The Study and Practice of Personal Information Management
William Jones

GUI Bloopers 2.0: Common User Interface Design Don'ts and Dos
Jeff Johnson

Visual Thinking for Design
Colin Ware

User-Centered Design Stories: Real-World UCD Case Studies
Carol Righi and Janice James

Sketching User Experiences: Getting the Design Right and the Right Design
Bill Buxton

Text Entry Systems: Mobility, Accessibility, Universality
Scott MacKenzie and Kumiko Tanaka-ishi

Letting Go of the Words: Writing Web Content that Works
Janice “Ginny” Redish

Personas and User Archetypes: A Field Guide for Interaction Designers
Jonathan Pruitt and Tamara Adlin

Cost-Justifying Usability
Edited by Randolph Bias and Deborah Mayhew

User Interface Design and Evaluation
Debbie Stone, Caroline Jarrett, Mark Woodroffe, and Shailey Minocha

Rapid Contextual Design
Karen Holtzblatt, Jessamyn Burns Wendell, and Shelley Wood

Voice Interaction Design: Crafting the New Conversational Speech Systems
Randy Allen Harris

Understanding Users: A Practical Guide to User Requirements: Methods, Tools, and Techniques
Catherine Courage and Kathy Baxter

Susan Fowler and Victor Stanwick

The Mobile Connection: The Cell Phone's Impact on Society
Richard Ling

Information Visualization: Perception for Design, 2nd Edition
Colin Ware

Interaction Design for Complex Problem Solving: Developing Useful and Usable Software
Barbara Mirel

The Craft of Information Visualization: Readings and Reflections
Written and edited by Ben Bederson and Ben Shneiderman

HCI Models, Theories, and Frameworks: Towards a Multidisciplinary Science
Edited by John M. Carroll

Web Bloopers: 60 Common Web Design Mistakes, and How to Avoid Them
Jeff Johnson

Observing the User Experience: A Practitioner's Guide to User Research
Mike Kuniavsky

Paper Prototyping: The Fast and Easy Way to Design and Refine User Interfaces
Carolyn Snyder
Moderating Usability Tests
Principles and Practices for Interacting

Joseph S. Dumas
Beth A. Loring
Contents

Preface ............................................................................................... xiii
Acknowledgments ............................................................................. xv
About the Authors ........................................................................... xvii

CHAPTER 1  Introduction ................................................................. 1
1.1 Why This Book? ................................................................. 1
1.2 What Is Usability Testing? ......................................................... 2
1.3 The Importance of Moderating Skills ........................................ 3
1.4 The Golden Rules of Moderating ............................................. 3
1.5 Cultural Points of View .......................................................... 4
1.6 About the Sidebars in This Book .............................................. 4
1.7 About the Videos that Accompany This Book ............................ 4
1.8 About the Companion Web Site .............................................. 5

CHAPTER 2  Getting started as a test moderator .............................. 7
2.1 What Makes a Great Moderator? .............................................. 7
  2.1.1 Understanding usability testing ........................................ 7
  2.1.2 The basics of interacting ................................................. 8
  2.1.3 The ability to establish and maintain a rapport ............... 8
  2.1.4 Lots of practice ........................................................... 9
2.2 Roles of a Moderator ............................................................... 9
  2.2.1 The Gracious Host ........................................................ 9
  2.2.2 The Leader .................................................................. 10
  2.2.3 The Neutral Observer .................................................. 10
  2.2.4 Other possible roles ...................................................... 11
  2.2.5 When roles change ...................................................... 11
  2.2.6 When roles conflict ..................................................... 11
2.3 Testing Locations .................................................................... 12
2.4 Test Preparation ..................................................................... 12
  2.4.1 Planning ahead ............................................................ 12
  2.4.2 Planning for many tasks .............................................. 14
  2.4.3 Understanding the domain and product ..................... 15
2.5 Jump-Starting Your Moderating Skills ................................... 15
  2.5.1 Six things you can do first ......................................... 15
  2.5.2 The big challenges ..................................................... 16

CHAPTER 3  Golden rules 1 through 5 ............................................. 19
3.1 Rule 1: Decide How to Interact Based on the Purpose
  of the Test ............................................................................. 20
Contents

3.1.1 The type of test ............................................................ 20
3.1.2 The product’s stage of development ......................... 21
3.1.3 Relationship with developers .................................. 22

3.2 Rule 2: Protect Participants’ Rights .......................... 23
3.2.1 Compensation ............................................................. 23
3.2.2 Informed consent ........................................................ 23
3.2.3 Confidentiality ........................................................... 24
3.2.4 Balance of purpose and risk .................................... 26
3.2.5 Priorities ...................................................................... 26

3.3 Rule 3: Remember Your Responsibility to Future Users 26
3.3.1 Letting participants struggle .................................... 27
3.3.2 Conflicting responsibilities ......................................... 28

3.4 Rule 4: Respect the Participants as Experts, but Remain in Charge ......................................................... 28
3.4.1 Controlling logistics and pacing ............................... 28
3.4.2 Stopping unacceptable behavior ................................. 29
3.4.3 Dealing with uncertainty ............................................. 29
3.4.4 Projecting authority ..................................................... 30
3.4.5 Dispelling negativity .................................................... 31
3.4.6 Managing visitors ....................................................... 32

3.5 Rule 5: Be Professional, Which Includes Being Genuine ................................................................. 33
3.5.1 Dos for making and maintaining a connection .......... 33
3.5.2 Don’ts for making and maintaining a connection ....... 35
3.5.3 When you’re not in the room ................................. 37

CHAPTER 4 Golden rules 6 through 10 .......................................................... 39

4.1 Rule 6: Let the Participants Speak! ............................... 39
4.1.1 Speakership ................................................................. 40
4.1.2 Appropriate interruptions ............................................ 40
4.1.3 Judicious speaking ....................................................... 41
4.1.4 Silent communication .................................................. 41

4.2 Rule 7: Remember That Your Intuition Can Hurt and Help You ................................................................. 42
4.2.1 Your intuition can hurt you .......................................... 42
4.2.2 Your intuition can help you ........................................... 42

4.3 Rule 8: Be Unbiased ........................................................ 43
4.3.1 Use an unbiased test script .......................................... 43
4.3.2 Use unbiased questions ................................................ 44
4.3.3 Keep answers unbiased .............................................. 45
4.3.4 Watch nonverbal cues ................................................. 45
4.4  Rule 9: Don’t Give Away Information Inadvertently ............ 46
    4.4.1 Giving an assist ............................................................ 46
    4.4.2 Explaining the designer’s intent or being defensive .......... 47
    4.4.3 Recording all suggestions ............................................ 48
4.5  Rule 10: Watch Yourself to Keep Sharp ............................. 48

CHAPTER 5  Initial contacts ............................................................ 51
5.1  Recruiting ................................................................. 51
    5.1.1 Contacting participants .............................................. 52
    5.1.2 Advertising ................................................................. 53
    5.1.3 Explaining the test ...................................................... 54
    5.1.4 Screening candidates ............................................... 57
    5.1.5 Confirming appointments .................................... 59
5.2  When Participants Arrive .................................................. 59
    5.2.1 Greeting participants ................................................ 60
    5.2.2 Creating comfort ....................................................... 60
    5.2.3 Obtaining informed consent ...................................... 61
5.3  The Pretest Briefing .......................................................... 64
    5.3.1 Preparing yourself ..................................................... 64
    5.3.2 Preparing participants ............................................... 64
    5.3.3 Using a script or checklist .......................................... 65
    5.3.4 Practicing the think-aloud technique ......................... 66
    5.3.5 Confirming that participants are ready ..................... 67
5.4  Transitioning to the Tasks .................................................... 68
    5.4.1 Starting the tasks ...................................................... 68
    5.4.2 Conducting a pretest interview ................................. 68

CHAPTER 6  Interacting during the session ..................................... 71
6.1  Interacting for a Reason ...................................................... 71
6.2  Keeping Them Talking .......................................................... 72
    6.2.1 Prompting as a reminder ............................................ 72
    6.2.2 Prompting the silent ones ......................................... 73
6.3  When and How to Probe ...................................................... 73
    6.3.1 Probing questions ..................................................... 74
    6.3.2 Planned versus spontaneous probes ........................... 74
    6.3.3 Probes to avoid ....................................................... 75
    6.3.4 Common probes ..................................................... 75
6.4  Providing Encouragement ..................................................... 76
    6.4.1 Encouraging statements to avoid ............................... 76
    6.4.2 Common encouraging statements ............................... 77
6.5 Dealing with Failure ................................................................. 77
  6.5.1 Participants’ self-blame ...................................................... 78
  6.5.2 The moderator’s distress .................................................. 78
  6.5.3 The participant’s distress .................................................. 79
  6.5.4 Responses to participants’ distress .................................... 80
  6.5.5 Stopping a test ................................................................. 81
  6.5.6 What you shouldn’t do when a participant fails ............ 82

6.6 Providing Assistance .............................................................. 83
  6.6.1 An assist ........................................................................ 83
  6.6.2 Giving assistance ............................................................ 84
  6.6.3 Interventions versus assists ........................................... 85
  6.6.4 Not giving assistance ..................................................... 85
  6.6.5 Levels of assistance ....................................................... 86
  6.6.6 Completing a task for a participant .............................. 87
  6.6.7 Measuring assists .......................................................... 88

CHAPTER 7 Interacting during post-test activities ............................. 91
  7.1 Maintaining Your Roles ......................................................... 91
  7.2 Determining the Order of Activities .................................... 92
  7.3 Clarifying Things That Occurred during the Test ............... 93
  7.4 Administering Ratings and Questionnaires ........................... 94
    7.4.1 Questionnaires ............................................................. 94
    7.4.2 Reasons behind the ratings .......................................... 95
    7.4.3 Accuracy of ratings ...................................................... 96
  7.5 Asking Open-Ended Questions ............................................ 97
  7.6 Allowing Others to Interact with Participants ....................... 98
  7.7 Final Activities .................................................................... 100
    7.7.1 Providing incentives ..................................................... 100
    7.7.2 Ending the session ....................................................... 101

CHAPTER 8 Interacting in a remote test session ....................... 105
  8.1 What Is Remote Testing? ..................................................... 105
    8.1.1 Synchronous and asynchronous testing ....................... 105
    8.1.2 The technology ............................................................ 106
    8.1.3 Advantages and disadvantages ................................ 107
  8.2 Preparing for the Session ..................................................... 109
    8.2.1 Recruiting ................................................................. 109
    8.2.2 Obtaining informed consent and confidentiality ............ 110
    8.2.3 Determining the equipment candidates have ............. 110
    8.2.4 Establishing willingness and downloading software ....... 113
10.5 Children and Teens .............................................................. 149
  10.5.1 Grouping children by age ........................................ 150
  10.5.2 Recruiting children and teens .................................. 150
  10.5.3 Interacting during the session ................................. 152
10.6 People From Other Cultures ................................................ 152
  10.6.1 Interacting with participants from the same and other cultures ..................................................... 153
  10.6.2 Adapting your techniques ........................................ 155
CHAPTER 11 Integrating the videos ........................................................... 157
  11.1 About the Videos ............................................................. 157
    11.1.1 The test session videos ............................................. 157
    11.1.2 Use of the videos ...................................................... 158
  11.2 Content of the Videos ...................................................... 159
    11.2.1 Video 1: Pretest briefing with a checklist ............... 159
    11.2.2 Video 2: Pretest briefing following a script ............ 159
    11.2.3 Video 3: Interacting during the session,
        example 1 .................................................................. 162
    11.2.4 Video 4: Interacting during the session,
        example 2 .................................................................. 162
    11.2.5 Video 5: Interacting in a remote testing
        situation ........................................................................ 162
    11.2.6 Video 6: Post-test interview ..................................... 162
  11.3 The Future of Usability Testing ........................................... 162
    11.3.1 Current trends ........................................................... 164
    11.3.2 What’s next? .............................................................. 167
References ....................................................................................... 169
Index ............................................................................................... 175
Preface

From many conversations with other usability testers, we know that our training as moderators was typical. We both learned how to moderate usability tests the same way: a colleague let us watch a few sessions and then watched us struggle for one or two sessions. There was no formal training and no set of professionally accepted procedures.

Since then, we have moderated numerous usability tests and watched thousands of sessions and debated good and bad practices with colleagues over the years. Clearly, a logical and practical approach to training moderators to be as effective as possible in the pursuit of valid usability testing was overdue. We looked at the literature and found some good, but limited, advice. Two currently available books on how to conduct a test, Dumas and Redish (1993) and Rubin (1994), each have one chapter on moderating. A later source, Snyder (2003), has several chapters, but they focus on moderating tests of paper prototypes. No previously published authors have presented a set of rules that underlie effective moderating.

While preparing a tutorial on test moderation for the Usability Professionals’ Association annual meeting, we realized that our best practices (developed through the trials and errors of two decades) could be captured in a set of professional guidelines. Moderating is more than just an art. Unfortunately, it is not something any intelligent person can walk in and do effectively. So, we created the ten golden rules of moderating that we present in chapters 3 and 4 and apply throughout.

Our experiences made very clear that new moderators need more than just verbal descriptions of how to interact with test participants. They need to see experienced moderators in action, dealing with specific situations. To illustrate how the rules translate into practice, we filmed a set of videos, several of which were later remade to accompany this book. In addition, we invited some of our colleagues to discuss what they saw in each video. We filmed these panel discussions, too. The videos and panel discussions can be found on the publisher’s web site (www.mkp.com/moderatingtests). Also on the site is a table that lists all of the places in the book where each video and the web site are discussed.

Our goal for this book is to enrich the learning experience for new test moderators. In doing so, we hope to establish a consensus that we and our colleagues can use to move moderating from an art passed on in private to a set of agreed-upon practices that can be used in an effective training program.
Acknowledgments

We have had the support and hard work of many colleagues in creating this book. Several of our colleagues at Bentley College helped us clarify our ideas and our writing. Lena Dmitrieva and Eva Kaniasty reviewed the first drafts of the chapters, stimulating us to rethink some of our initial ideas. Rich Buttiglieri handled the video and recording technology and acted as the director for the videos. Andrew Wirtanen edited and transferred the videos onto the web site and Steve Salina filmed the panel discussions. Chris Hass’s expertise in interacting with disabled participants provided much of the practical advice found in chapter 10.

The reviewers of the manuscript were an enormous help: Whitney Quesenbery, Kelly Gordon Vaughn, Catherine Courage, Ron Perkins, Steve Krug, and Mary Beth Rettger. Each one made a unique contribution that improved our ideas and writing. In addition, they were uniformly encouraging, which all authors need during the stressful days when a finished manuscript seems unreachable.

The colleagues who acted in the videos allowed us to illustrate our golden rules. We often asked them to portray poor practices, which they did with good humor. The expert panel we asked to comment on the videos provided exactly what we wanted—their spontaneous and honest reactions to what they saw. We had great fun watching them provide insights to supplement the videos and the book.

Finally, we want to thank Diane Cerra at Elsevier, who encouraged us to write this book and whose encouragement and guidance in its early stages were invaluable.

* * *

For seven years I taught a course in usability evaluation in the Bentley College graduate program. A section of every course included a discussion of moderating a test. I am grateful to the students in those classes who pushed me to examine my assumptions and to find ways to explain my thinking. My wife, Martie, has encouraged me to write this—my third book—without complaint. Somehow, back in high school, she saw the potential in me that I couldn’t see in myself, and I saw in her the woman to spend a life with. Forty-three years later, our relationship continues to evolve.

Joe Dumas

The person to whom I am most grateful is Joe. He became my mentor way back in 1986 when usability testing was in its infancy, and our professional paths have crossed so often that they seem to be interwoven. It was Joe’s idea to present a tutorial on the topic of
interacting with test participants in the first place, and it was his idea to ask Diane Cerra about turning it into a book. He and I make a good team, and I am proud to call him my friend. I’m also grateful to my husband, Jon, and my son, Stephen, for giving me the time, space, and quiet to work on the book for so many months.

Beth Loring
About the Authors

Joe Dumas is a recognized expert in usability evaluation with twenty-five years of experience. He has moderated or observed others moderate thousands of usability testing sessions and has taught numerous students and usability professionals how to moderate. He is currently a usability consultant for Oracle Corporation. He was a senior human factors specialist at Bentley College's Design and Usability Center and taught graduate courses in the college's graduate program in Human Factors in Information Design. He has a Ph.D. in cognitive psychology from the State University of New York at Buffalo. He is the author of A Practical Guide to Usability Testing (with Ginny Redish), Designing User Interfaces for Software, and numerous articles written for researchers and practitioners.

Beth Loring is director of the Bentley Design and Usability Center, a research and consulting organization in Waltham, Massachusetts, USA. Beth has more than twenty years of experience in human factors engineering and product usability.

Since the mid 1980s, Beth has evaluated a wide array of products and services including desktop software, consumer products, web sites, business applications, and medical devices. Beth’s online experience includes testing of financial, e-commerce, educational, intranet, and business-to-business applications.

Before joining Bentley, Beth was a principal research scientist at the American Institutes for Research in Concord, Massachusetts, and before that she served as the human factors team lead at IDEO Product Development in Boston. She teaches courses on usability testing in Bentley’s Information Design Certificate Program.

Beth holds a master of science degree in engineering design from Tufts University and is a Certified Human Factors Professional. She has published more than twenty papers and is coauthor of a case study in Understanding Your Users: A Practical Guide to User Requirements (Morgan Kaufmann, 2005).
Moderating Usability Tests